



Additional Reports

Agenda: *Corporate & Works Committee*

Date: *Monday 17 August 2009*

Time: *6.00pm*

Corporate & Works Committee

Outline of Meeting Protocol & Procedure:

- The Chairperson will call the Meeting to order and ask the Committee/Staff to present apologies or late correspondence.
- The Chairperson will commence the Order of Business as shown in the Index to the Agenda.
- At the beginning of each item the Chairperson will ask whether a member(s) of the public wish to address the Committee.
- If person(s) wish to address the Committee, they are allowed four (4) minutes in which to do so. Please direct comments to the issues at hand.
- If there are persons representing both sides of a matter (eg applicant/objector), the person(s) against the recommendation speak first.
- At the conclusion of the allotted four (4) minutes, the speaker resumes his/her seat and takes no further part in the debate unless specifically called to do so by the Chairperson.
- If there is more than one (1) person wishing to address the Committee from the same side of the debate, the Chairperson will request that where possible a spokesperson be nominated to represent the parties.
- The Chairperson has the discretion whether to continue to accept speakers from the floor.
- After considering any submissions the Committee will debate the matter (if necessary), and arrive at a recommendation (R items which proceed to Full Council) or a resolution (D items for which the Committee has delegated authority).

Delegated Authority (“D” Items):

- General financial and corporate management of the Council, except those specifically excluded by statute, by Council direction or delegated specifically to another Committee.
- Note: This not to limit the discretions of nominated staff members exercising Delegated Authorities granted by the Council.
- Quarterly review of Council's Management Plan.
- Finance Regulations, including:-
 - Authorisation of expenditures within budgetary provisions where not delegated;
 - Quarterly review of Budget Review Statements;
 - Quarterly and other reports on Works and Services provision; and
 - Writing off of rates, fees and charges because of non-rateability, bad debts, and impracticality of collection.
- Auditing.
- Property Management.
- Asset Management.
- Traffic Management - Works Implementation.
- Works and Services - Monitoring and Implementations.
- Legal Matters and Legal Register.
- Parks and Reserves Management.
- Infrastructure Management, Design and Investigation.
- To require such investigations, reports or actions as considered necessary in respect of matters contained within the Business Agenda (and as may be limited by specific Council resolution).
- Confirmation of Minutes of its Meeting.
- Any other matter falling within the responsibility of the Corporate and Works Committee and not restricted by the Local Government Act or required to be a Recommendation to Full Council as listed below.

Recommendation only to the Full Council (“R” Items):

- Such matters as are specified in Section 377 and within the ambit of the Committee considerations.
- The voting of money for expenditure on works, services and operations.
- Rates, Fees and Charges.
- Donations
- Matters which involve broad strategic or policy initiatives within responsibilities of the Committee.
- Matters not within the specified functions of the Committee.
- Asset Rationalisation.
- Corporate Operations:-
 - Statutory Reporting; - Delegations.
 - Adoption of Council's Management Plans; - Policies.
 - Quality Service/Communications; - Tenders as per Regulation requirements.
 - Leases.
 - Matters reserved by individual Councillors in accordance with any Council policy on "safeguards" and substantive changes

Committee Membership:

6 Councillors

Quorum:

The quorum for a Committee meeting is 4 Councillors.

Additional Information Relating to Committee Matters

Site Inspection

Other Matters

Meeting Agenda Additional Reports

Item	Subject	Pages
1	Leave of Absence and Apologies	
2	Late Correspondence	
3	Declarations of Interest	

Items to be Submitted to the Council for Decision with Recommendations from this Committee

R2	2008/2009 Revotes – 2007/2008 - 331G	57
R3	Supply, Installation and Maintenance of Parking Meters in Paddington and Double Bay - Tender No. 09/09	75

Item No: R2 Recommendation to Council
Subject: 2008/2009 Revotes
Author: Michelle Phair, Team Leader Financial Services
File No: 331G 2007/2008
Reason for Report: To report on the status of capital projects in the 2008/2009 budget as at 30 June 2009 and recommend the revote of budget allocations for 2008/2009 projects not commenced before 30 June 2009

Recommendation:

- A. THAT the revote of budget allocations for the projects detailed in ANNEXURES 1 and 2 to this report be adopted
-

Background:

Expenditure relating to the 2008/2009 financial year has been finalised. This report seeks a recommendation to revote budget allocations for projects not commenced at 30 June 2009.

Council adopts an annual budget for the provision of works and services and the delivery of projects each year. At the end of each year the votes of expenditure lapse, except as provided in Clause 211 of the Local Government (General) Regulation 2005, whereby:

- (3) *All such approvals and votes lapse at the end of a council's financial year. However, this subclause does not apply to approvals and votes relating to:*
- (a) *work carried out or started, or contracted to be carried out, for the council, or*
 - (b) *any service provided, or contracted to be provided, for the council, or*
 - (c) *goods or materials provided, or contracted to be provided, for the council, or*
 - (d) *facilities provided or started, or contracted to be provided, for the council,*
- before the end of the year concerned, or to the payment of remuneration to members of the council's staff.*

There are instances where projects are commenced toward the end of a financial year but not completed. Where this is the case the budget allocation remains and can be rolled into the new financial year for the completion of the project. As the Regulation does not require these amounts to be revoted, this has been done administratively. An overview is provided later in the report. Where the project has not been commenced Council is required to formally revote the budget allocation into the new financial year budget.

Preliminary 2008/2009 Financial Year Result

Finalisation of the 2008/2009 year end accounts is well advanced. The preliminary result indicates that Council's working funds result is in line with budget expectations. In light of Council's unsuccessful Special Rate Variation application, the revotes and rollovers have been reviewed to minimise the funding required to complete projects. It is considered that there is no further scope to reduce the recommended revotes.

Capital Works Program

A summary of the delivery of capital projects appears in the table below.

CAPITAL WORKS PROGRAM

Description	Forecast	Complete or In Progress *	% of Budget Spent	Not Commenced (Revote)
Infrastructure & Stormwater Levy Works	6,861,655	6,852,086	99.9%	31,463
Environmental Levy Works Program	690,356	656,782	95.1%	25,375
Environmental & Infrastructure Levy	401,963	330,733	82.3%	79,427
<i>Total Environmental Works Program</i>	<i>1,092,319</i>	<i>987,515</i>	<i>90.4%</i>	<i>104,802</i>
Streetscapes	6,980,590	6,798,332	97.4%	175,000
Traffic Infrastructure	1,729,714	786,258	45.5%	900,300
Flood Plain Management	468,106	425,044	90.8%	75,000
Parks & Reserves	3,364,656	3,338,986	99.2%	20,000
Playgrounds	368,778	294,277	79.8%	79,400
Sportsfields	288,400	286,707	99.4%	0
Commercial/Leased Properties	201,999	202,000	100.0%	0
Parks/Ovals Buildings	137,614	86,000	62.5%	35,000
Depots	16,009	10,709	66.9%	0
Council Offices	558,936	541,244	96.8%	0
Community Facilities	96,490	76,425	79.2%	21,800
Library Buildings	361,257	361,782	100.1%	0
Car Parks	90,382	45,382	50.2%	45,000
Information Systems	730,883	416,875	57.0%	174,728
	23,347,788	21,509,623	92.1%	1,662,493

* Funds expended in 2008/2009 plus rollover funds

92.1% of capital projects were completed or in progress at 30 June. Funding for projects in progress at 30 June has been rolled forward into the 2009/2010 Budget.

Details of the Capital Works Program rollovers and revotes for 2008/2009 are attached as **ANNEXURE 1**.

Other Projects

Other projects completed over the course of the year are summarised in the table below:

OTHER PROJECTS

Description	Forecast	Complete or In Progress*	Not Commenced (Revote)
<i>Community Services</i>			
Community Development	50,000	50,000	0
Library Information Services	3,000	0	3,000
Library - General	465,706	465,287	0
Library - Paddington	72,978	61,215	0
<i>Corporate Services</i>			
Risk Management	80,000	69,169	0
<i>Technical Services</i>			
Traffic Investigation & Reports	73,500	14,750	45,000
Street Lighting			
Engineering Design	18,000	8,080	0
Asset Management	30,118	30,118	0
Public Open Space Planning & Asset Mgmt	49,263	49,263	0
Waste Services Supervision			
Plant Replacement Program	179,000	27,500	151,500
<i>Planning & Development</i>			
Environmental Planning	54,390	29,390	25,000
Heritage Planning	2,953	2,900	0
Environmental Protection	22,265	22,200	0
Urban Design	19,137	10,000	0
<i>General Manager</i>			
Business Centre Support	56,000	46,050	0
Communications	25,894	8,878	5,542
	1,202,204	894,799	230,042

* Funds expended in 2008/2009 plus rollover funds

A full list of project budgets recommended for revote are attached as **ANNEXURE 2**.

Conclusion:

At the end of each financial year the budget provisions for projects that have not commenced, or are not contracted to commence, lapse. The budget provisions for these projects are required to be revoted into the new financial year budget. This needs to be done by resolution of Council. Budget provisions for projects in progress at 30 June do not lapse and, therefore, have been rolled into the new financial year administratively.

Overall 92.1% of the capital works program was completed or in progress at 30 June. The report also details a number of projects recommended for revote in both the operating and capital budgets. Details of rollovers plus the revote recommendations are summarised in ANNEXURES 1 & 2.

Michelle Phair
Team Leader Financial Services

Don Johnston
Manager Finance

Annexures:

1. Capital Works Program – 2008/2009 Rollovers & Revotes
2. Other Projects – 2008/2009 Rollovers & Revote

Item No: R3 Recommendation to Council
Subject: **SUPPLY, INSTALLATION and Maintenance of Parking meters in paddington and Double Bay**
Author: Trent Scrivener – Project Engineer Streetscapes
File No: Tender No. 09/09
Reason for Report: To recommend to Council the acceptance of a Tender

Recommendation:

- A. That Council enter into a contract with Reino International Pty Ltd for the lump sum price of \$644,941.00 to supply, install and maintain Pay & Display meters in Paddington and Double Bay, being \$489,375 for the supply, installation and commissioning of the meters and \$155,576 for the maintenance and statistical reporting over three years.
- B. That the successful and unsuccessful tenderers be advised accordingly.

Background:

The Woollahra Traffic & Transport Study 2000 identified parking as a major issue in the Woollahra Municipality. The study found that business areas, including Oxford Street, Paddington, and the Double Bay shopping centre, were heavily utilised throughout the week and that appropriate parking controls should be considered to improve parking turnover and availability.

During 2000 Council commissioned parking studies for both Oxford Street and Double Bay. The studies found that parking turnover in these centres was poor, that overstaying was frequent and difficult to police, and that congestion was high as a consequence of motorists circulating repetitively to find a parking space. It was the recommendation of these reports that meters be introduced to improve parking turnover.

Following extensive public consultation, in 2002/2003 Council installed parking meters in Oxford Street, Paddington, and in the Double Bay shopping centre. In total 76 'Hectronic' model parking meters were introduced with 26 units being installed in Paddington and 50 units installed in Double Bay. Following the introduction of meter parking, there has been a marked improvement in parking turnover and availability in these centres.

During 2007/08 several matters relating to parking meters were raised by Councillors, including the use of credit cards or smart cards for payment, the introduction of other payment methods, and alternatives to parking meters. Additionally, the Double Bay Chamber of Commerce, also requested that Council take steps to upgrade meters in Double Bay to accept credit card payments to improve customer service and convenience.

Monitoring of the existing meters showed that the effectiveness of these meters was decreasing and that costs to Council for maintenance and loss of revenue of these aging meters was increasing. In effect, the existing 'Hectronic' Multi-Bay parking meters are now approaching the end of their service life.

Council staff, in consultation with Luxmoore Parking Consultants, investigated the latest parking meter technologies and recommended to Council at the Corporate & Works Committee meeting on 4 August 2008 that the existing Multi-Bay parking meters be replaced with Pay & Display parking

meters, with credit card transaction capabilities. This would best suit the Paddington and Double Bay shopping precincts.

The report to C&W gave consideration to the advantages of a Pay & Display meter system over the existing Multi-Bay meter system, as listed below:

- Constant repainting of bay numbers on the footpath is not required with Pay & Display meters;
- Motorists cannot use remaining time paid for by a previous motorist, thereby reducing the loss of revenue to Council;
- In the event of a meter breakdown motorists can use an alternate meter, thereby reducing the loss of revenue to Council;
- The Pay & Display meters have real-time credit card facilities which are becoming increasingly popular and would be used frequently by customers. Where credit card facilities have already been introduced in other council's, they account for 15-30% of payments. They reduce the frequency and cost of cash collection and counting, reduce the potential for fraud, and reduce maintenance on the coin chute and coin selector mechanism. Generally, experience shows that motorists paying by credit card will pay for an extended period to ensure that they do not receive an infringement notice. This has been shown to increase income significantly by up to 15%;
- Tickets double as a receipt for motorists;
- A significant advantage is that there is scope to reduce the number of meters required to cover the same area. For example, Guilfoyle Avenue in Double Bay currently has 16 Multi-Bay meters because of its dual carriageway. This can be reduced to seven Pay & Display meters. As part of this contract it is proposed to reduce the initial 76 Multi-Bay meters to 54 Pay & Display. This equates to a reduction of meters by 30%; and
- The new Pay & Display meters can be controlled remotely by an electronic central management system (CMS). The CMS's 24 hour remote link to Council provides real-time information including alarms, parking and revenue statistics, audits and reports. The CMS also allows tariffs to be changed on the meters in the office without having to reprogram each individual meter onsite.

At the Corporate & Works Committee meeting held on 4 August 2008 it was resolved:

- A. *That, in order to improve convenience and flexibility of payment for users, Council's paid parking system be upgraded to provide credit card payment facilities as a matter of priority, and options for other methods of payment be actively pursued and a further report provided.*
- B. *That, to give effect to (A),*
 1. *Tenders be called for the replacement of existing meters in Oxford Street, Paddington and Double Bay with Pay & Display on-street meters equipped with credit card reader facilities, and*

2. *Expressions of Interest be called for mobile phone based parking payment systems to supplement on-street meters, and that a further report be submitted on the proposals received.*

In accordance with the above resolution tenders were called for the supply, installation and maintenance of new Pay & Display meters, including a central management system (CMS), to replace the dilapidated 'Hectronic' multi-bay meters. As part of this contract the contractor will be required to maintain the meters for a minimum three year period.

Council has also called tenders for cash collection services for the new meters and this will be reported to the next Corporate & Works Committee meeting. Council's current collection service is operating on a month-to-month basis and it is proposed to continue this service until such time as the new meters are commissioned. It should be noted that the cash collection service contract and the Parking Meters tender are in no way interdependent.

In respect of Council resolution B(2) above a separate expression of interest regarding mobile phone payment for parking has been called and the results of this will be the subject of further report. It should also be noted that telephone payment systems for parking is an independent service and does not in any way influence the selection of parking meters.

Tenders Received

Tender 09/09 for the 'Supply, Installation and Maintenance of Parking Meters in Paddington and Double Bay' was advertised in the Sydney Morning Herald on Tuesday 16 July 2009, and in the Wentworth Courier on Wednesday 17 July 2009.

Tenders for this work closed at 2:30pm, 23 July 2009. Five tenders were received prior to the closing date and time.

Tenderers were requested to submit a lump sum price for the supply, installation and commissioning of the parking meters and for the maintenance of meters and statistical reporting for a three year period. Tenderers were also required to submit a Schedule of Rates.

In the initial assessment of the tender documents it was apparent that all tenderers had not satisfactorily completed all schedules of the tender. However, it was the opinion of the assessment panel that all five were conforming tenders in that all information which had been requested had been provided in their submissions. Clarification was sought from all tenderers on these matters and was subsequently received. It should be noted that no change to the rates offered in the tenders has occurred as a result of this process.

The cost breakdown of the tenders is detailed in Table 1 below. Tenders are listed in alphabetical order.

Supply, Installation and Commissioning costs are quoted separately from the Maintenance and Statistical Reporting costs as the later costs are for a three year period.

Table 1 – Tenderers and Prices

TENDERERS	COMPONENT COST		TOTAL COST
	Supply, Installation & Commissioning (one off cost)	Maintenance & Statistical Reporting (for 3 years)	
1. Australian Parking & Revenue Control Pty Ltd	\$621,940.00	\$464,940.00	\$1,086,880.00
2. CDS Worldwide Pty Ltd	\$422,541.00	\$182,580.00	\$605,121.00
3. Global Integrated Solutions Pty Ltd	\$503,120.00	\$264,600.00	\$767,720.00
4. Reino International Pty Ltd	\$489,375.00	\$155,576.00	\$644,951.00
5. Wilson Technology Solutions	\$463,826.50	\$162,652.00	\$626,478.50

The tenders were assessed in accordance with the agreed selection criteria stated in the tender documents.

The tender panel comprised:

Alan Opera – Manager Engineering Services;

Gary Gale – Business Centre & Street Cleaning Coordinator;

Armodee Reece – Traffic & Transport Administration Officer; and

Trent Scrivener - Commissioning Officer

Council has resolved that a probity adviser should be included during the tender assessment stage for high risk, high value or sensitive projects. This contract was deemed to meet this definition and Les Windle, Manager Governance, has provided advice on probity issues.

Tender Assessment

A Pre-tender Meeting was held at Council Chambers on 1 July 2009 at which several items were clarified for the tenderers.

Prior to the closing date the tender panel agreed on the weightings that would be used against the published selection criteria.

The tenders were initially given a score against each item of the selection criteria by the tender panel, which resulted in a score out of 100.

Following the closure of tenders each of the tenderers were requested to clarify their tenders through written submissions. The tender scores were then adjusted by the tender panel based on the information provided.

Table 2 shows the final scores and rankings of all tenders considered.

Table 2 – Final Tender Scores

TENDERER	Tender & Business Requirements <i>Weighting: 0</i>	Demonstrated Experience <i>Weighting: 10</i>	Company Resources <i>Weighting: 2.5</i>	Program <i>Weighting: 10</i>	Quality Management <i>Weighting: 10</i>	OHS & Environmental Capabilities <i>Weighting: 2.5</i>	Quality & Range of Product <i>Weighting: 15</i>	Price <i>Weighting: 50</i>	Total Score <i>Weighting: 100</i>	Ranking
Australian Parking & Revenue Control	n/a	7.50	2.50	5.91	10.00	2.13	11.25	27.84	67.13	5
Global Integrated Solutions Pty Ltd	n/a	10.00	2.50	8.75	7.50	1.88	15.00	39.41	85.04	4
Wilson Technology Solutions	n/a	7.50	2.50	4.54	10.00	1.38	11.25	48.30	85.46	3
CDS Worldwide Pty Ltd	n/a	5.00	2.50	5.00	7.50	1.38	15.00	50.00	86.38	2
Reino International Pty Ltd	n/a	10.00	2.50	8.08	7.50	1.88	15.00	46.91	91.86	1

- Tender & Business Requirements:** Tenderers were asked to provide fundamental tender information such as the Form of Tender, collusive tendering & conflict of interest declarations and insurance information. These mandatory tender requirements carry no weighting but are necessary for probity reasons.
- Demonstrated Experience:** Tenderers were asked to provide details of past works including description and size of contracts.
- Company Resources:** Tenderers were asked to provide details of key personnel, proposed subcontractors and the company's financial condition.
- Program:** Information was requested from the tenderer demonstrating their understanding of staging the installation works, duration of the tenderers installation program and pro-active and re-active maintenance activities required by Council.
- Quality Management:** Information was requested from the tenderer demonstrating company quality systems and any accreditations in this area.
- OHS & Environmental Capabilities:** Information was requested from the tenderer pertaining to company OH&S and environmental management systems and any accreditations in these areas.
- Quality & Range of Product:** The tenderer provided technical detail in the form of manuals, warranties, credit card processing and CMS capabilities which were assessed by the tender panel against the Council's specifications. Tenders also provided a working example of their offered product for the tender panel to inspect and test.
- Price:** The lowest evaluated tender price is allocated 100% for that weighting. Other tenderers' prices are then ranked by a percentage fraction of the lowest price.

Assessment Summaries

Australian Parking & Revenue Control Pty Ltd (APARC) – Conforming, ranked no. 5

APARC's key personnel have over 10 years experience in the electronic controls industry.

APARC's Pay & Display meter is made in France and their Australian headquarters are at St Peters, Sydney. APARC has installed its meters around Sydney for the City of Sydney, Burwood, Willoughby and Waverley Councils.

As part of the tender process APARC provided the tender panel with a demonstration of its offered Pay & Display meter. The meter was user friendly, small in comparison to most of the others who tendered and could be produced in a variety of colours including blue, green, grey and black.

APARC have offered a five year warranty with their meter which is the highest warranty offered by all tenderers.

APARC maintain their own meters. APARC's pro-active maintenance regime consists of quarterly services to minimise meter faults.

For re-active maintenance APARC have advised that the CMS will automatically alert their technicians to a fault alarm raised by a meter. A phone message system will be employed to receive faults called in by the public, which will be checked by APARC's director on a regular (daily) basis. APARC have advised that their response time to rectify meter faults can be achieved in approximately one hour which is well within Council's specified four hours.

APARC scored full marks for their environmental management system and QA system which are ISO accredited. Their OH&S system for Australia is a web-based management system which appears to be comprehensive.

APARC can comply with most of Council's requirements for the supply, installation and maintenance of a Pay & Display meter network, except for the operating system of their CMS. Council requires an MS Windows© based CMS. Currently APARC's CMS is Java© based but they are in the process of having the system converted to run using MS Windows©. APARC have indicated that the changeover of operating systems should be completed in December 2009.

APARC's proposed program to supply, install and commission their meters is 18 weeks. This duration exceeds Council's requirement to have the new Pay & Display meters installed before December 2009. APARC have indicated that the program could be shortened by 5 weeks if the meters were air freighted from France at an additional cost of \$900 per unit.

APARC's prices were the highest with a lump sum price \$1,086,880. This tender was the highest price tendered for both the supply, installation and commissioning of the meters (\$621,940.00), and for the Maintenance and Statistical Reporting (\$464,940.00 over 3 years, or \$154,980.00 per annum).

Global Integrated Solutions Pty Ltd – Conforming, ranked no. 4

GIS's key personnel have over 10 years experience in the electronic controls and parking industry.

GIS's Pay & Display meter is New Zealand made and their Australian headquarters is located in Melbourne.

GIS has installed its meters around Sydney for Parramatta, Willoughby, Lane Cove and Manly Councils.

As part of the tender process GIS provided the tender panel with a demonstration of its offered Pay & Display meter. The meter was user friendly, compact in comparison to others who tendered and could be easily assimilated into the Paddington and Double shopping precincts. It is available with extruded aluminium sides available in a limited number of colours, combined with stainless steel front and back.

GIS have offered a 12 month warranty with their meter.

GIS' maintenance will be undertaken by Linfox Armaguard. GIS's pro-active maintenance regime consists of quarterly services to minimise meter faults.

For re-active maintenance GIS have advised that their response time to rectify meter faults can be achieved within Council's specified four hours. A re-active maintenance operations plan detailing how faults are recorded, dispatched and closed was not included with the WTS submission.

GIS's QA, environmental management and OH&S management systems are not accredited but appear to be comprehensive.

GIS can comply with all of Council's requirements for the supply, installation and maintenance of a Pay & Display meter network.

GIS's proposed program to supply, install and commission their meters was the shortest at 8 weeks. This duration meets Council's requirement to have the new Pay & Display meters installed before December 2009 subject to Council's approval.

GIS's lump sum price was the second highest at \$767,720. This tender was the second highest price tendered for both the supply, installation and commissioning of the meters (\$503,120.00), and for the Maintenance and Statistical Reporting (\$264,600.00 over 3 years, or \$88,200.00 per annum).

Wilson Technology Solutions (WTS) – Conforming, ranked no. 3

WTS's key personnel have over 10 years experience in the electronic controls and parking industry.

WTS has installed its meters around Sydney for the City of Sydney, Willoughby and Leichhardt Councils. Woollahra Council's current 'Hectronic' Multi-Bay meters are manufactured by Wilson. WTS's Pay & Display meters are made in Germany and their Australian headquarters are in Melbourne.

As part of the tender process WTS provided the tender panel with a demonstration of its offered Pay & Display meter. The meter was user friendly but larger in size when compared to others who tendered and would stand out more in the streetscape. Its extruded aluminium housing can be produced in a wide range of colours, however is less vandal resistant than stainless steel.

WTS have offered a two year warranty with their meter.

WTS maintain their own meters. WTS's pro-active maintenance regime consists of quarterly services to minimise meter faults. WTS currently maintain Council's existing 'Hectronic' Multi-Bay meters.

WTS's pro-active maintenance service was found to be unsatisfactory and therefore Council, in 2008, cancelled this service and engaged another maintenance company. WTS currently continues providing the re-active maintenance service for Council, however, this service is basic and lacks the detailed reporting required by Council.

For re-active maintenance WTS did advise that they have a designated national call centre for fault reporting and that their response time to rectify meter faults can be achieved in under two hours which is within Council's specified four hours. A re-active maintenance operations plan detailing how faults are recorded, dispatched and closed was not included with the WTS submission.

WTS are ISO 9001 accredited for their quality assurance system. Their OH&S system is not ISO accredited but appears to be comprehensive. WTS's environmental management system appears to be limited as only a company Environmental Policy was provided as part of their tender submission.

WTS can comply with most of Council's requirements for the supply, installation and maintenance of a Pay & Display meter network. WTS has requested that the standard contract conditions regarding liquidated damages be changed. Council has specified in the contract conditions that liquidated damages of \$500 per day shall be applied should the agreed date for Practical

Completion be breached. WTS have advised that it is against their policy to accept liquidated damages.

WTS's proposed program to supply, install and commission their meters is 15 weeks. The 15 week program would mean that the meters would be installed around the week of Christmas. This is unacceptable to Council. The program would likely have to be extended two to three weeks for installation of the meters to take place early in the New Year.

WTS's lump sum price was the second lowest at \$626,478.50. This tender was the second lowest price tendered for both the supply, installation and commissioning of the meters (\$463,826.50), and for the Maintenance and Statistical Reporting (\$162,652.00 over 3 years, or \$54,217.33 per annum).

CDS Worldwide Pty Ltd – Conforming, ranked no. 2

CDS's key personnel have over 10 years experience in the electronic controls industry.

CDS's Pay & Display meter is Australian made and their headquarters are in Melbourne. CDS has installed its meters in Sydney for the Sydney Olympic Park Authority.

As part of the tender process CDS provided the tender panel with a demonstration of its offered Pay & Display meter. The meter was user friendly, similar in size compared to others who tendered and could be easily assimilated into the Paddington and Double shopping precincts. The meter is available in stainless steel and a limited number of colours.

CDS have offered a 12 month warranty with their meters.

CDS's pro-active maintenance regime consists of quarterly services to minimise meter faults. CDS have advised that their meter maintenance would be provided by Council's current pro-active meter maintenance company, Sydney I-Tech.

CDS have not advised that their response time to rectify meter faults can be achieved under Council's specified four hours. It is Council staff's opinion that Sydney I-Tech are currently providing a satisfactory pro-active maintenance service, however are unproven at re-active maintenance. A re-active maintenance operations plan detailing how faults are recorded, dispatched and closed was not included with the CDS submission.

CDS's QA and OH&S systems are not ISO accredited but appear to be comprehensive. CDS's environmental management system appears to be limited as only a company Environmental Policy was provided as part of their tender submission.

CDS can comply with all of Council's requirements for the supply, installation and maintenance of a Pay & Display meter network.

CDS's proposed program to supply, install and commission their meters was 16 weeks. This duration exceeds Council's requirement to have the new Pay & Display meters installed before December 2009. The 16 week program would mean that the meters would be installed around the week of Christmas. This is unacceptable to Council. The program would likely have to be extended two to three weeks for installation of the meters to take place early in the New Year.

CDS's lump sum price was the lowest at \$605,121. This tender was the lowest price tendered for the supply, installation and commissioning of the meters (\$422,541.00), and was the third lowest price tendered for the Maintenance and Statistical Reporting (\$182,580.00 over 3 years, or \$60,860.00 per annum).

Reino International Ltd – Conforming, ranked no. 1

Reino's key personnel have over 10 years experience in the electronic controls industry.

Reino has installed approximately 2,000 of its Pay & Display meters around Sydney for the City of Sydney, North Sydney, City of Ryde, Warringah and Mosman Councils. Reino's Pay & Display meters are Australian made and their headquarters are in St Leonards, Sydney.

As part of the tender process Reino provided the tender panel with a demonstration of their offered Pay & Display meter. The meter was user friendly, similar in size when compared to others who tendered and the stainless steel housing can be produced in a wide range of colours including red, blue, green, grey, and black.

Reino have offered a two year warranty with their meter.

Reino maintain their own meters. Reino's pro-active maintenance regime consists of quarterly services to minimise meter faults.

For re-active maintenance Reino have demonstrated to the tender panel how they can direct their technicians to a faulty meter using a system that coordinates electronic fault alarms from their meters and calls from the public to their designated call centre. Using this impressive monitoring system Reino have advised that their response time to rectify meter faults can be achieved in under two hours which is within Council's specified four hours. Reino have shown that meter downtime across their existing meter maintenance contracts Sydney-wide is less than 1%.

Reino do not have an ISO accreditation for their quality assurance, environmental management or OH&S systems. However the systems that Reino have in place to coordinate quality assurance, environmental management and OH&S procedures are very comprehensive and appear to be ISO compliant.

Reino can comply with all of Council's requirements for the supply, installation and maintenance of a Pay & Display meter network.

Reino's proposed program to supply, install and commission their meters is 13 weeks. This duration meets Council's requirement to have the new Pay & Display meters installed before December 2009 subject to Council's approval.

Reino's lump sum price was the third lowest at \$644,941. This tender was the third lowest price tendered for the supply, installation and commissioning of the meters (\$489,375.00), and was the lowest price tendered for the Maintenance and Statistical Reporting (\$155,576.00 over 3 years, or \$51,858.66 per annum).

Conclusions:

The lump sum prices submitted by GIS (\$767,720) and APARC (\$1,086,880) are not competitive.

CDS (\$605,121) is the lowest priced tenderer, being \$21,357.50 less than WTC (\$626,478.50) and \$30,830 less than Reino (\$644,951). However, CDS appears to have limited experience with a tender of this value and size and very limited experience in Sydney in comparison to the other tenderers. CDS's re-active maintenance procedure in Sydney has not been presented in detail and is untested, which is a risk to Council.

Although WTC is the second lowest tenderer on price, based on Council past experience we have serious concerns regarding WTC's ability to perform satisfactorily under this contract. Additionally, WTS's extruded aluminium housing is less vandal resistant than the stainless steel housings offered by Reino and CDS. This represents a vandalism risk with units able to be scratched and graffiti applied.

Of the three highest scoring tenders only Reino is able to install the meters before December 2009 subject to approval by Council.

Reino do not have an ISO accreditation for their quality assurance, unlike WTC, however the systems that Reino have in place to coordinate quality assurance, environmental management and OH&S procedures are very comprehensive and appear to be ISO compliant.

Out of the five tenderers it appears Reino have the best support system in Sydney for maintaining Council's new Pay & Display meter network and at the best price. Council can expect rapid responses to meter faults by Reino with a machine downtime of less than 1%.

It is the tender panel's opinion that the best value for money and the most comprehensive service will be provided by Reino. This is reflected in the tender assessment where Reino has outscored both CDS and WTS significantly by 5-6 percent.

Identification of Income and Expenditure:

In the current budget Council has allocated a total of \$750,000 being \$600,000 in the capital work budget for the supply, installation and commissioning of new Pay & Display meters and \$150,000 in the operating budget for meter maintenance and cash collection services.

The price tendered by Reino includes \$489,375.00 for the supply, installation and commissioning of new meters which is well within the budget of \$600,000.

The price tendered by Reino includes \$155,576.00 over three years or \$51,858.66 per annum for the maintenance and statistical reporting of the meter system. Council's budget of \$150,000 covers all operational costs for the parking meters which includes maintenance, transaction and banking costs, communications costs, and cash collection costs. Although the maintenance and statistical reporting portion of the tender is for a three year period, these services will not require payment of a lump sum and costs will be incurred monthly.

Tenders have closed for meter cash collection services and a report will be presented to the next C&W Committee. It is apparent that the current operational budget will be sufficient to cover all operational costs to December 2009 when the new meters will be installed and also cover the maintenance and statistical reporting costs and the cash collection costs for the remainder of 2009/10.

Trent Scrivener
Project Engineer Streetscapes

Warwick Hatton
Director Technical Services

POLITICAL DONATIONS DECISION MAKING FLOWCHART FOR THE INFORMATION OF COUNCILLORS

