

10 February 2012

## REFERRAL RESPONSE - HERITAGE

**FILE NO:** DA 531/2011/1

**ADDRESS:** 1 Kiaora Road DOUBLE BAY 2028

**PROPOSAL:** Kiaora Lands Redevelopment comprising demolition of existing buildings and structures, a new 4 storey commercial/retail building fronting New South Head Road and including a new public library, a new 3 level commercial/retail building fronting Kiaora Lane, including a supermarket and public parking (465 spaces) and public domain improvements.

**FROM:** Sara Reilly Strategic Heritage Officer

**TO:** Mr P Kauter

### Application documents

The following documentation provided by the applicant has been examined for this referral response:

- Drawing set by Nettleton Tribe Architects, dated 12 October 2011, and numbered DA\_000 – DA\_006, DA\_011 – DA\_019, DA\_021 – DA\_025, DA\_031, DA\_032, DA\_041, DA\_042, DA\_051, DA\_52, DA\_054, DA\_55, DA\_61, DA\_062, DA\_071, DA\_81, DA\_82, all issue B
- Heritage Assessment and Heritage Impact Assessment by Graham Brooks and Associates, dated September 2011
- Letter from Graham Brooks and Associates dated 18 October 2011 regarding changes to New South Head Road building concept
- Model
- Finishes boards (4 no.)
- 3D walk-through video

### Research

The following research was undertaken in the preparation of this assessment:

- The site was previously inspected on the 16 June 2011 and on other previous occasions. The locality was inspected.

Review of documents and photographic evidence:

- Review of Council's property system to establish dates of earlier building and development applications for the subject and surrounding properties
- Review of pre-DA referral response
- Review of Council's photography files relevant to immediate area
- Review of Council's inventory sheets
- Review of Council's aerial photography and mapping database
- Review Google Maps – street view

### Statutory and policy documents

The following statutory and policy documents are relevant to the application:

- Woollahra LEP 1995
- Double Bay Centre DCP 2002 particularly Appendix 2: Kiaora Lands 2011 (Amendment 67)

### **Heritage status**

- The subject site does not contain any heritage items in Woollahra LEP 1995.
- The subject building is in the vicinity of heritage item the Golden Sheaf Hotel at 429 New South Head Road.
- The subject site is not in a heritage conservation area.
- The subject building is within the Double Bay Centre precinct.
- The subject site is not listed on the State Heritage Register.
- The subject site is not a potential heritage item nor within the vicinity of a potential heritage item.

### **Significance of any heritage item in the vicinity**

The Golden Sheaf Hotel is an Art Deco hotel building of three storeys in Ruf-tex red textured brickwork and has a tiled roof. It was designed by Prevost and Ruwald in c.1935.

The façade is intact above awning level. There is horizontal brick banding, and long six-paned timber double-hung window sashes among other details, referencing Classical or Georgian style and ornament. There are expressive vertical elements, ceramic feature panels, cast-iron balustrading and other details referencing Art Deco ornamentation. There have been substantial changes to the interior over time, which have eroded its internal significance. The ground floor façade has also been altered, although appears to retain its essential character. The rear of the building presents as a modern amalgamation of materials and forms, which allows rear entry to the ground floor bar and outdoor area.

The Golden Sheaf is a landmark building within the streetscape of Double Bay. Its large brick gable and distinctive façade are highly visible from the approach to Double Bay along New South Head Road. It has significance as a fine representative example of Inter-War pub architecture, and is associated with well-known architect Reginald Provost.

### **Assessment of heritage impact**

#### ***Relevant statutory and policy documents***

The assessment is made using the following statutory and policy heritage conservation provisions:

#### **Woollahra LEP 1995 Part 1 clause 2(1)(g) and 2(2)(g); Part 4 clause 27 and 36A**

- There are no heritage items or conservation areas within the proposed development site, however there are 12 buildings proposed to be demolished. As recommended in the pre-DA heritage referral, a 'Heritage Assessment and Heritage Impact Assessment' has been provided with the application which addresses the heritage significance and proposed demolition of these properties.

- The site is adjacent to the Golden Sheaf Hotel, which is a local heritage item in Woollahra LEP 1995. Consideration must be given to the impact of the proposed development upon this heritage item.

#### *Significance of the site*

The land upon which the Kiaora Lands development is proposed was first developed as market gardens in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, and then became the grounds for the NSW Lawn Tennis Association in 1904. In 1922, the Tennis Association moved to White City in Rushcutters Bay, and the land was subdivided for residential development. The subdivision resulted in a mixture of dwelling houses and small apartment blocks. A large number of Inter-War houses previously existing within the former Lawn Tennis subdivision have now been demolished to make way for car parking areas.

#### Demolition of existing buildings on the site

Twelve properties at 1-7 Kiaora Road, 1 2 and 4 Anderson Street, 3-7 Anderson Street and 2 Patterson Street are now owned by Council or Woolworths and are scheduled for demolition. Their demolition is pre-empted in the Double Bay Centre DCP Amendment 67 - Kiaora Lands.

#### *Anderson Street*

**No 1 Anderson Street** is an Inter-War bungalow, of face brick construction with a hipped and gabled tiled roof, and incorporates details such as leadlight windows, encaustic tiling to front path and porch, and a brick and wrought iron fence to the street. Generally contributory in nature to the streetscape and the predominant character of the area, but considered of limited representative value only.

**No 2 Anderson Street** is a two-storey residential Inter-War flat building in a simplified Arts and Crafts style, with face brickwork and a hipped tile roof, with details such as shingle-clad bay windows to either side of a double-columned entry porch, and large double-hung picture windows. Generally contributory in nature to the streetscape and the predominant character of the area, but considered of limited representative value only.

**No. 4 Anderson Street** is a single-storey Inter-War bungalow made from dark purple engineering bricks, with a complex gabled and hipped tiled roof, and details such as leadlight decorative windows and a large gabled verandah to the north (now closed in). Generally contributory in nature to the streetscape and the predominant character of the area, but considered of limited representative value only.

**3-7 Anderson Street** is the 'Old Telephone Exchange' building and is an Inter-War building of Neo-Classical style. It has large round arch-headed openings, curved corner detail to the brickwork, and an ornate entry door embellished with mouldings and scroll brackets supporting an overhead sill. It was previously assessed by Council's former Heritage Officer Libby Maher in 1999 (ref DA 182/1999). Her assessment was based in part on a report titled "Old Telephone Exchange, Anderson Street, Double Bay & 1 Kiaora Road, Double Bay: Proposed Demolition: Heritage Study and Impact Statement" dated 28 May 1999 by John Oultram (not viewed for this report). Her assessment concurred with the assessment by John Oultram regarding the significance of the property, in terms of the building having some historical, some historical associational and some aesthetic significance. Her conclusion was that

although the telephone exchange building is rare, there is a better listed example in Waverley LEP. She concluded that the building's proposed demolition was acceptable, but that the historical and aesthetic value of the telephone exchange is worthy of interpreting through signage on site, and that the Oultram heritage report and a copy of the original 1925 drawings be lodged with the Woollahra Local History Centre.

- An interpretive plaque for the 'Old Telephone Exchange' should form part of the current proposal. It was recommended previously that a brass plaque be affixed on site permanently and inscribed with an image of the building's main elevation and some relevant text in raised lettering. This plaque has now been located on the plans adjacent the public domain, which is positive. The plaque will need to be designed and executed as part of the consent. Exact location and detailing to be approved by Council's Heritage Officer.

#### *Patterson Street*

**No. 2 Patterson Street** is an Inter-War dwelling, and is considered not to be a contributory building, having a very plain bungalow appearance with no features of note. It has been substantially altered from its original composition. Assessed as having no heritage significance.

It is noted that nos. 4, 6 and 8 Patterson Street have been approved for demolition as part of a residential redevelopment in 2006 that would build 7 new townhouses on the site. This approval was a L&E Court approval.

It is noted that nos. 2 and 4 Anderson Street and 2 Patterson Street had also been approved for demolition and the building of 7 townhouses under a previous Kiaora Lands development which did not proceed.

#### *Kiaora Road*

The seven buildings to Kiaora Road (**1 – 7 Kiaora Road**) were built by the renowned and prolific builder Edward Knox Harkness around 1910 with his favoured Victorian Gothic details. The group is part of a selection of buildings mentioned in the Heritage Study for the Municipality of Woollahra by Hughes, Trueman and Ludlow in 1984, in which it states "Federation Period Speculative Developments: The whole area bounded by Manning and Kiora Road, Double Bay is occupied by a cohesive group of Federation/Edwardian cottages". The area referred to in the study has been under redevelopment in one form or another for a long time, and these cottages are likely to be a remnant of any formerly cohesive group. They are in a state of extended neglect.

The row of Federation cottages to Kiaora Road has significant contributory value. They have decorative details to their facades such as ornate bracketed chimneys, decorative gables with protruding bay windows, timber turned verandah posts and ornate timber brackets, timber gable detailing and fascia boards, other plaster details, timber panelled entry doors, and timber double-hung windows. There is a continuous sandstone wall, and some mature vegetation to the front yards and to the rear of the properties, with some vegetation substantial in size.

However, the properties are in poor condition, with front tiles broken or loose, verandah posts rotted, windows boarded up, tree litter collecting on roofs, trees

overgrown etc. The buildings are either empty or tenanted, and have been reduced to a state of 'demolition through neglect'. Despite being capable of being retained, repaired and restored, they have been earmarked for demolition as part of the new commercial development, as the LEP and DCP envisage a change of character and use with the enlargement of the business and shopping precinct.

### *Conclusion*

Of the twelve buildings scheduled for demolition, most have limited heritage significance which would be restricted to a contributory nature. The 'Old Telephone Exchange' is the exception; however this building has been previously assessed and found not to reach the criteria suitable for listing as a heritage item.

Of some concern is the loss of an intact group of seven Federation terraces to Kiaora Road. These buildings have no statutory protection and would be unlikely to reach the criteria for listing as heritage items.

In general the buildings to Patterson and Anderson Streets are modest in scale and style, and reflect an earlier key phase of development of the Double Bay amphitheatre, after the subdivision of the Double Bay Tennis Grounds in 1923. There is no statutory protection for the contributory heritage value of these properties, as they are not capable of reaching the criteria suitable for listing as heritage items.

- Sandstone block walls from Kiaora Road front boundary walls are to be salvaged and reused in the new development.
- Archival recording of all buildings would need to be submitted prior to Construction Certificate stage.

### Double Bay Centre DCP 2004 - Appendix 2: Kiaora Lands 2011

#### **A2.3.2.2 Patterson Street**

- A plaque exists on the corner of Patterson and Anderson Streets which will need to be relocated to a suitable place, preferably within a pedestrian area of the public domain. The new location has been noted on the plans, which is positive. The exact location should be approved by Council's Heritage Officer.
- There is a long strip of rough-faced sandstone walls skirting the car park to the northern side of Patterson Street. These stones should be retained and re-used in any new development, as they are of historic and aesthetic interest and general value. This stonework is noted on the plans for re-use in the pedestrian link adjacent Patterson Street, which is positive.

#### **A2.3.2.4 New South Head Road**

*Provide a built form that recognises, and is sympathetic to, the adjacent heritage item.*

*Establish a new civic building and presence.*

- Changes to the New South Head Road façade of the library since the pre-DA are still minimal and relate primarily to the large horizontal fin element at the top of the western end of the new library façade. The vertical 'downstand' has been

removed from the underside of the upper level fin or canopy, which is a positive, as it ‘thins out’ the visual presence of this fin.

- The main concern was the lack of mediation architecturally at the zone where the new library building meets the existing Hotel. However, when viewing the 3D walk-through provided on Council’s dedicated Kiaora Lands website, it can be seen that the upper levels of the new development are set back to such a degree that it is mainly the metal louvres to the new façade which form a relationship with the existing Hotel façade. These louvres mimic the scale and bulk of the Hotel façade and thus provide a relationship.
- Fortunately, the Kiaora Lands DCP has required the new façade of the streetfront building to the western wing be set back by a minimum of 1.35m partly to allow more of the side elevation of the Hotel to be exposed to the street than currently exists. This has been complied with in the proposal, which is positive. The office lobby is set back even further at the corner, allowing greater depth and articulation of the pedestrian area, which is positive.
- The relationship of the new building and its fenestration details to the coursing lines and parapet of the Hotel is very basic and barely legible. The Heritage Impact Statement states that “Detailing of the façade reflects the parapet line of the adjoining heritage item”, however this is only true in the most basic of ways.
- It is still recommended that the roof top plant room be located away from the boundary with the Hotel, or set back several metres, to reduce the impact on the visual appearance of the heritage item. Similarly, the plant room on the other boundary should also be located away from the side boundary, to reduce the visual impact of the height of the new development. They should be moved at least 3-5m away from the boundary. (The lift shafts may be difficult to relocate, but any fire or air conditioning water tanks should be able to be pivoted. They will be highly visible from many points around the amphitheatre of the Bay, and moving them to the centre of the roofs will limit their impact).
- The bluestone has been deleted and replaced with granite. This is acceptable.

## **Conclusion**

The application is generally acceptable as it complies adequately with the relevant provisions of those statutory and policy documents associated with the site.

## **Recommendation**

The following conditions should be included in the approval:

1. The plant rooms atop the library/retail building are to be located at least 3 metres away from the side boundaries.
2. Stone walling from the Kiaora Road front boundary walls of nos. 1 -7 Kiaora Road is to be salvaged and reused. Suitable location and arrangement is to be approved by Council’s Heritage Officer.
3. Davis Cup plaque to be retained and relocated as noted on plans. Exact location to be approved by Council’s Heritage Officer.
4. Interpretive plaque to be designed and produced for the site of the ‘Old Telephone Exchange’ building, of brass, with image of the main building

elevation, and relevant text with raised lettering. Exact details and location as noted on plans to be approved by Council's Heritage Officer.

5. Archival recording will be required of all of the buildings proposed to be demolished in accordance with the industry standards for archival recording. Archival records to be submitted prior to Construction Certificate and to the approval of Council's Heritage Officer.

Sara Reilly  
Strategic Heritage Officer