



Urban Planning Committee

Agenda: *Urban Planning Committee*

Date: *Monday 31 March 2008*

Time: *6.00pm*

Outline of Meeting Protocol & Procedure:

- The Chairperson will call the Meeting to order and ask the Committee/Staff to present apologies or late correspondence.
- The Chairperson will commence the Order of Business as shown in the Index to the Agenda.
- At the beginning of each item the Chairperson will ask whether a member(s) of the public wish to address the Committee.
- If person(s) wish to address the Committee, they are allowed four (4) minutes in which to do so. Please direct comments to the issues at hand.
- If there are persons representing both sides of a matter (eg applicant/objector), the person(s) against the recommendation speak first.
- At the conclusion of the allotted four (4) minutes, the speaker resumes his/her seat and takes no further part in the debate unless specifically called to do so by the Chairperson.
- If there is more than one (1) person wishing to address the Committee from the same side of the debate, the Chairperson will request that where possible a spokesperson be nominated to represent the parties.
- The Chairperson has the discretion whether to continue to accept speakers from the floor.
- After considering any submissions the Committee will debate the matter (if necessary), and arrive at a recommendation (R items which proceed to Full Council) or a resolution (D items for which the Committee has delegated authority).

Delegated Authority (“D” Items):

- To require such investigations, reports or actions as considered necessary in respect of matters contained with the Business Agendas (and as may be limited by specific Council resolutions).
- Confirmation of Minutes of its Meeting.
- Any other matter falling within the responsibility of the Urban Planning Committee and not restricted by the Local Government Act or required to be a Recommendation to Full Council as listed below:

Recommendation only to the Full Council (“R” Items):

- Such matters as are specified in Section 377 of the Local Government Act and within the ambit of the Committee considerations.
- Broad strategic matters, such as:-
 - Town Planning Objectives; and
 - major planning initiatives.
- Matters not within the specified functions of the Committee.
- Matters requiring supplementary votes to Budget.
- Urban Design Plans and Guidelines.
- Local Environment Plans.
- Residential and Commercial Development Control Plans.
- Rezoning applications.
- Heritage Conservation Controls.
- Traffic Management and Planning (Policy) and Approvals.
- Commercial Centres Beautification Plans of Management.
- Matters requiring the expenditure of moneys and in respect of which no Council vote has been made.
- Matters reserved by individual Councillors, in accordance with any Council policy on "safeguards" and substantive changes.

Committee Membership:

7 Councillors

Quorum:

The quorum for a committee meeting is 4 Councillors.

WOOLLAHRA MUNICIPAL COUNCIL

Notice of Meeting

27 March 2008

To: His Worship The Mayor, Councillor Geoff Rundle, ex-officio
Councillors John Comino (Chair)
 Claudia Cullen (Deputy Chair)
 Christopher Dawson
 Wilhelmina Gardner
 Keri Huxley
 Julian Martin
 David Shoebridge

Dear Councillors

Urban Planning Committee Meeting – 31 March 2008

In accordance with the provisions of the Local Government Act 1993, I request your attendance at a Meeting of the Council's **Urban Planning Committee** to be held in the **Committee Room, 536 New South Head Road, Double Bay, on Monday 31 March 2008 at 6.00pm.**

Gary James
General Manager

Additional Information Relating to Committee Matters

Site Inspection

Other Matters

Meeting Agenda

Item	Subject	Pages
1	Leave of Absence and Apologies	
2	Late Correspondence	
3	Declarations of Interest	

Items to be Decided by this Committee using its Delegated Authority

D1	Confirmation of Minutes of Meeting held on 10 March 2008	1
----	--	---

Items to be Submitted to the Council for Decision with Recommendations from this Committee

R1	98B Bellevue Road, Bellevue Hill – 1080 [G] BH	2
----	--	---

Item No: D1 Delegated to Committee
Subject: **Confirmation of Minutes of Meeting held on 10 March 2008**
Author: Les Windle, Manager – Governance
File No: See Council Minutes
Reason for Report: The Minutes of the Meeting of Monday 10 March 2008 were previously circulated. In accordance with the guidelines for Committees' operations it is now necessary that those Minutes be formally taken as read and confirmed.

Recommendation:

That the Minutes of the Urban Planning Committee Meeting of 10 March 2008 be taken as read and confirmed.

Les Windle
Manager - Governance

Item No: R1 Recommendation to Council
Subject: **98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill**
Author: Susan O'Neill – Strategic Heritage Officer
Chris Bluett – Manager Strategic Planning
File No: 1080 [G] BH
Reason for Report: To respond to the Council decision made on 13 December 2004, deferring the inclusion of 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill as a heritage item in Schedule 3 Local Environment Plan 1995, to allow further consideration of objections and reports from the property owner.

Recommendation:

- A. THAT 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill not be listed as a heritage item.
- B. THAT the heritage inventory sheet for 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill be amended to include the Council's decision.

1. Background

In 1997, Howard Tanner and Associates Pty Ltd completed a preliminary heritage investigation which formed part of the residential study for land zoned Residential 2(b) in Bellevue Hill, Darling Point and Rose Bay. The investigation identified individual properties, building groups, streetscapes, landscape features and areas, and recommended that additional assessment of their heritage significance be carried out. This study, referred to as the Tanner study, nominated 171 individual properties and forty-eight conservation groups and streetscapes in the three suburbs.

98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill was identified by the Tanner Study as a potential heritage item, citing, *'Representative example of early suburban established town centre. The complex is a well-resolved example of combining the influences of the inter war free classical style in a building of substantial streetscape presence.'* Further assessment of the heritage significance of the property was carried out by Colin Brady, Architecture + Planning and a heritage inventory sheet was prepared for the property by Colin Brady in December 2003, amended by Libby Maher, Strategic Heritage Officer in July 2004.

Reports on the heritage significance of potential items, identified by the Tanner study, in Bellevue Hill, Rose Bay and Darling Point were considered by the Urban Planning Committee during its meetings on 27 September 2004, 1 November 2004 and 13 December 2004. A letter was provided to Council on behalf of the owners of 98B Bellevue Rd by Stephen Davies from City Plan Heritage dated 28th October, 2004. **[annexure 1]** At the meeting of 13 December 2004, Council deferred the inclusion of 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill, as a heritage item in Schedule 3 to allow further consideration of objections and reports from the property owner.

2. Assessment of 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill and review of documentation

The Council engaged a heritage consultant, Colin Brady from Colin Brady Architecture + Planning, to assess the heritage significance of a number of properties in Rose Bay and Bellevue Hill, identified by the Tanner study. Mr Brady prepared heritage inventory sheets for each property using the NSW Heritage Office heritage assessment criteria. A heritage inventory sheet for 98B Bellevue Rd was prepared in December 2003. It was reviewed by Council's Strategic Heritage Officer, Libby Maher, and amended in July 2004. An inspection was carried out by Council's Strategic Heritage Officer, Jodi Ayre, 22 May 2007 and a Heritage Assessment, prepared by Architectural Projects Pty Ltd, was provided by the building owners following the site inspection. **[annexure 2]** A review of all information was carried out by Council's Strategic Heritage Officer, Susan O'Neill in March 2008, following an inspection of the property on 19 March 2008 and an amended inventory sheet is provided. **[annexure 3]**.

2.2 Consideration of significance and recommendation

The building at 98B Bellevue Road consists of two joined structures, the two storey shopfront fronting Bellevue Rd and the three storey flats behind, fronting Streatfeld Rd, over a basement of garages. The façade of the shopfronts and flats fronting Bellevue Rd (photographs 10, 11, 12) is a competent example of the Inter-War free classical style and the flats in the wing behind are a more subdued version.

The statement of significance prepared by Mr Brady identifies some degree of local significance for aesthetic and representative values and the contribution made by 98B Bellevue Rd to the streetscape. The Bellevue Rd façade was considered to be of aesthetic value as a classically inspired design and for the landmark impact the façade makes to the street, by addressing the sweeping curve of Bellevue Rd. The analogies made by Mr Brady between classical design, Palladian villas and 98B Bellevue Rd are somewhat overstated and his description refers primarily to the Bellevue Rd façade of the complex.

The Bellevue Rd portion of the complex consists of shopfronts and the entry foyer to the flats on the ground floor and three flats on the first floor. This elevation features a central gabled pediment in face brick, with a round plaster decorative detail in the centre and three original arched windows with brick arches, emphasised by fine hood moulds and a single outer double hung window either side. The Marseilles tiled hipped roof behind the pediment is flanked by a parapet at either end, effectively breaking up the overall mass and length of the façade. A deep rendered entablature provides a strong horizontal feature across the façade, getting increasingly deeper as the ground floor shop fronts step down the hill. *The Bellevue Rd façade fails to adequately address the slope of the street resulting in an overly large entablature that merges into a wall of render where the site fall allows some form of mezzanine. The thick entablature breaks the façade and the pediment and recessed verandah bays appear as an insignificant roof element.* [Jennifer Hill, Claude Hamilton p2]

The overall form and appearance of the Bellevue Rd façade is substantially intact. However, the shopfronts have been altered, individual awnings added over each shopfront and one first floor recessed verandah has been enclosed.

The flats contained in the wing behind the shops (photograph 9) do retain a substantial proportion of original fabric. However, the layouts were simple, the foyer and stairwells are uncelebrated (photographs 3, 4), the finishes are fairly austere, the external elevations are predominantly unembellished and subordinate to the Bellevue Rd façade and the rear flats portion of the overall complex is not a noteworthy example of Inter-War apartment buildings. The narrow lightwell between the shopfronts building and the flats wing is unattractive. (photographs 2, 5)

The residential/retail complex at 98B Bellevue Rd is comparable to the Plumer Road shops and other Inter-War residential/retail complexes built within Woollahra and elsewhere in Sydney.

The building was designed by Claude Hamilton, ARAIA, who was competent and successful, although not a well known, early 20th century architect. He designed a number of recognised apartment buildings in Potts Point, including Byron Hall in Macleay St, which are superior examples of his work than 98B Bellevue Rd.

It is recommended that 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill not be listed as a heritage item, for the following reasons:

- Primarily the complex is not of sufficient architectural merit to warrant its identification as an item of heritage;
- It is not of any social significance;
- It is not an outstanding example of Claude Hamilton's work and finer examples of his architectural expertise are existing;
- It is not a rare example of either its Inter-War Free Classical style, nor as a residential/retail development dating from the inter-war period.

3.0 Conclusion

In conclusion, 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill should not be listed as a heritage item on schedule 3 in the Woollahra Local Environment Plan 1995. While the form and scale of the building does provide substantial streetscape presence to Bellevue Rd, the design is not of sufficient merit to warrant listing as an item of heritage.

Susan O'Neill
Strategic Heritage Officer

Chris Bluett
Manager, Strategic Planning

ANNEXURES:

1. Objection to proposed listing of the property at 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill as a heritage item by Stephen Davies of City Plan Heritage, 28 October 2004
2. Heritage Assessment 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill by Architectural Projects Pty Ltd July 2007 and List of buildings by the architect Claude Hamilton ARAIA by Architectural Projects Pty Ltd
3. Inventory Sheet for 98B Bellevue Rd, Bellevue Hill, as amended March 2008
4. Photographs, taken by Mr Daniel Schwartz, B. Dig. Media (COFA, UNSW)